

## REMARKS

Claims 1-3, 9, 13-17, 23, 27-30 and 38-40 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Kim et al. (US Patent 6,570,864). With regard to claim 1, the Examiner states that Kim discloses Applicant's claim 1 limitations of linearly filtering a received signal to form a first filtered signal (Kim, Fig. 1, reference 201, 221, Fig. 2A, reference 110 and col. 1, lines 50-63) and despreading the first filtered signal (Kim, Fig. 1, ref. 201, 231, 251) and providing a plurality of symbol estimates for all corresponding code channels of the plurality of code channels (Kim, Fig. 1, outputs of 231, 232, 23N to adding element of 240 where these outputs are interpreted as symbol estimates of code channels). Applicants respectfully disagree with the Examiner's references to Kim as disclosing an apparatus and method of symbol determination comprising the aforementioned steps of claim 1.

Kim does not disclose a method comprising despreading a filtered signal and providing a plurality of symbol estimates for all corresponding code channels of the plurality of code channels. The receiver of Kim shown in FIG. 1 uses an equalizer per user per stage of the receiver, ref. 221, 222, 22N, whereas in Applicants' invention of claim 1, only a single equalizer is used per stage, the output of which is despread with all code channels to yield symbol estimates for the plurality of code channels. Conversely, each equalizer in Kim is tuned to a specific user, i.e., specific code channel. As shown in FIG. 2A and described in col. 3, line 64 to col. 4, line 4, the MMSE receiver of Kim includes a channel estimating part for estimating a phase component and an amplitude component of a particular user channel by using the output signal of the adaptive filtering part and includes a signal restoring part for restoring an original signal from a signal transmitted from a particular user by using the channel estimated signal from the channel estimating part 120 and the filtered signal from the adaptive filtering part 110. Thus, Kim discloses a method that comprises despreading a filtered signal and providing a plurality of symbol estimates for a single code channel.

Because independent claims 15, 28, 39 and 40 include the limitations of claim 1 discussed above, Applicants submit that these claim are patentable over Kim for the reasons set forth above.

In view of the foregoing remarks, it is submitted that independent claims 1, 15, 28, 39 and 40 are allowable over Kim et al. Applicants also submit that dependent claims 2-14, 16-27, and 29-38 are allowable by virtue of their dependency on their respective independent claims. Applicants respectfully request the reconsideration and reexamination of this application and the timely allowance of the pending claims. Please charge any fees associated herewith, including extension of time fees, to 50-2117.

Respectfully submitted,

Frank, Colin, et al.

SEND CORRESPONDENCE TO:

Motorola, Inc.  
Law Department

Customer Number: **22917**

By:

  
Lalita W. Pace

Attorney for Applicant

Registration No.: 39,427

Telephone: 847-538-5855

Fax: 847-576-3750